



MID DAY MEAL: REVIEW MISSION FOR GUJARAT

Second Review Mission 19 – 25th, 2010

As part of 2nd Review Mission, a team consisting of Smt Rita Chatterjee, (Joint Sec-MDM, MHRD), Shri D.B. Mehta (Joint Commissioner -MDM, GOG), Ms. Sejal Dand (State Advisor to National Comm. Apptd. By Hon. Supreme Court in WPC 196/2001), Dr. Ankita Sharma (Consultant, UNICEF, Gandhinagar). Co member Dr. Anindita Shukla (Consultant, Food & Nutrition-MDM, NSG) visited Gujarat to see the implementation of the scheme.

The team members would like to express gratitude to everyone who gave time, cooperation and hospitality during the visit.

Mid Day Meal Scheme

National Programme of Mid Day Meal in Schools (MDMS) is a flagship programme of the Government of India aiming at addressing hunger in schools by serving hot cooked meal, helping children concentrate on classroom activities, providing nutritional support, encouraging poor children, belonging to disadvantaged sections, to attend school more regularly, providing nutritional support to children to drought-affected areas during summer vacation, studying in Government, Local Body and Government-aided primary and upper primary schools and the Centres run under Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS)/Alternative & Innovative Education (SSA) of all areas across the country. In drought-affected areas MDM is served during summer vacation also.

Objectives of Joint Review Mission:

1. Review the system of fund flow from State Government to school/ cooking agency level and time taken in this process.
2. Review the management and monitoring system and its performance from State to school level.
3. Review the progress of the programme during 2010-11 with respect to availability of food grains and funds at the school/ cooking agency level, quality and regularity in serving the meal in the selected schools and districts, transparency in implementation role of teachers, involvement of community, convergence with school health Programme for supplementation of micronutrients and health check up etc.
4. Assess the satisfaction of children, parents and teachers about the implementation and impact of the scheme.
5. Review the maintenance of records at school/ cooking agency level.
6. Review the availability of infrastructure, its adequacy and source of funding.
7. Give suggestions for improvement in the implementation of the programme.

The second review mission has decided to visit the State of Gujarat and review the scheme in detail and provide suggestions for improvement. The mission comprising of above

mentioned members has visited 2 districts namely Junagarh (selected by the State Govt.) and Porbandar (selected by the review mission) of Gujarat.

State of Gujarat



The state of Gujarat is situated on the west coast of India, bounded by the Arabian Sea in the West, Rajasthan in the North and North-East, and Madhya Pradesh in the East and Maharashtra in the South and South East. The state also shares an international border with Pakistan at the north western fringe. It has the longest coastline of about 1600 km which is also the longest among all states in the country.

Gujarat is one of the most prosperous states of the country owing to its booming economy and industry. The state provides about 19.8% of the country's total industrial output and is the most industrialized state of the country. Gandhinagar, the capital of Gujarat is a beautiful planned city.

Gujarat is known for its rich culture and tradition. It is famous for its exquisite handicrafts and textiles. Gujarat is the birth place of Mahatma Gandhi and is connected intimately with many events pertaining to India's independence. The land is replete with beautiful temples, historical monuments, architectural and cultural heritages, pristine beaches and many more other attractions.

The name Gujarat has been derived from '**Gujarata**' meaning the land of Gurjars or Khazars. The Gurjars were originally dwellers of Punjab. They passed through Punjab and settled in some parts of Western India, which came to be known as Gujarat. The Gurjars ruled the land during 8th and 9th centuries AD, followed by Muslim rulers until the end of the 13th century. Gujarat then came under the control of Mughals and the Marathas in the mid 18th century followed by British in 1818. The British rule continued till India got her independence in 1947.

Junagadh



The district of Junagadh is located in the western part of Gujarat with its head quarters at Junagadh town. The district is bordered by Rajkot in the North, Porbandar in the North-West, Amreli in the East and Arabian Sea bordering in South and West. The district covers an area of 8846 sq. km with total population of 2,448,427 according to 2001 census. The Somnath temple and Gir National Park are located in Junagadh. For information on tourism in Junagadh .It is a picturesque town located in the foothills of the Girnar Hills in Gujarat. The town derives its name from the ancient fort of Uparkot built in the 4th century on a plateau at the eastern edge of the town. The massive fort located here is surrounded by great walls with deep moat inside. The fort has a triple-arched gateway for entering into it. The hill town is famous for its Ashokan rock edicts, temples and monuments.

Porbandar

Porbandar is an administrative district of Gujarat located in the western part of the state with its head quarters located at Porbandar town. The district covers an area of 2298 sq. km with total population 5, 36, 854 square kilometers. Porbandar was carved out of Junagadh district. The place is famous as it was the birth place of Mahatma Gandhi, the father of nation. There are some worth visiting sites in and around Porbandar. The house where Mahatma Gandhi, the father of nation passed his early life still stands in the western part of the city. Next to the house is the “**Kirti Mandir Museum**” that preserves the photographs of Mahatma’s life, and extracts from his speeches and writings.



1. OBSERVATIONS OF THE REVIEW MISSION

1.1 FUND FLOW UNDER MDM

The funds under mid day meal from Govt. of India Govt., are released to Govt. of Gujarat from there to Commissionerate. The Commissionerate further releases the funds to the Collectorate then from Collectorate to Mamlatdar Office and Block level.

Component	Date of receiving of fund by the state from Gol	Date of release of funds by the state to Commissioner ate	Date of release of funds by the Commissioner ate to District
Cooking cost	29/4/2010	06.05.10	22.04.10* and 19.05.10
MME	29/4/2010	06.05.10	19.05.10
Transportation	29/4/2010	<u>Information not provided</u>	<u>Information not provided</u>

*State share released in advance

1.2. Lifting of food grains

The responsibility of the lifting of food grains and supply lies with the Gujarat State Civil Supply Corporation (GSCSC). It also handles the food grains under AAY, PDS, BPL etc. GSCSC has been entrusted the task of procurement and supply of food grains and other food commodities. Edible oil, pulses (Dal), as well as food grains for children studying in Std. I to VII are procured through a centralized purchase system. Based upon the prescribed daily food components and probable number of beneficiaries of students, a six monthly indent is sent to the GSCSC for procurement of all food commodities. Lifting of foodgrains starts from FCI godown to District godown, then distributed to taluka Godowns. GSCSC supplies food commodities i.e pulses and oil to district godown and from there it is distributed to taluka godowns. From the taluka godown it is taken to the MDM centers either in schools or centralized kitchen. After procurement, all commodities are supplied up to the level of MDM centre through the Public Distribution System.

Lifting of food grain at State level

<u>State</u>	<u>Food grains lifted (MTs.)</u>	<u>Amount Paid till August 2010 (Amount in lakh.)</u>
Gujarat	7684.563	47.5

1.3 Transportation from state to District level

The mission came to know that the Food grain is lifted by the Gujarat State Civil Supply Corporation (GSCSC) at state level, further the wheat is sent to the Millers for grinding and addition of micro nutrients. From the miller it reaches the school and Centralized kitchen. However the rice reaches to district go down from GSCSC and from GSCSC it reaches to Block godown of GSCSC from there to PDS shops and from PDS shops the school organizers come and procure rice.

1.4 Payment of cost of food grains (rice) at district level

<u>District</u>	<u>Lifting (Quantity MTs)</u>	<u>Payment Made (Lacs)</u>
Porbandar	Data Not Available	
Junagarh	570.568	3.24

1.5 Coverage of Institution

Almost all the institutions approved by the MDM – PAB 2010-11 were covered during the first qtr of the FY-2010-11 in Porbandar. However only 76% coverage was explored in Junagarh in FY-2010-11 in the first qtr.

INSTITUTIONS APPROVED AND COVERED DURING 2010-11 IN THE FIRST QUARTER			
DISTRICT	APPROVED	COVERAGE	%COVERAGE
PORBANDAR	277	297	107
JUNAGARH	1300	1000	76

1.6 Allocation of Food grains

The Porbandar district was approved 28703 children in the FY 2010-11 and 23992 (83%) children availed MDM in the first qtr. The allocation was 950 kgs and the same amount of food grains was lifted during the first qtr however the utilization was 608 kgs (64%). Similarly the Junagarh district was approved 134091 children in the FY 2010-11 and (97%) children availed MDM in the first qtr. The probable reasons that emerged from the discussions with the officers at district level, staff at school level, community member, children and the parents were that children did not availed MDM due to deep rooted caste differences. The caste difference was not only between the children but also cook cum helper and the children. From the responses it could be elicited that the children were discouraged by the parents that MDM is donor based meal that is being served.

Number of children approved and availed MDM in the first quarter 2010-11		
DISTRICT	NUMBER OF CHILDREN APPROVED 2010-11	NUMBER OF CHILDREN AVAILED MDM IN FIRST QUARTER 2010-11
PORBANDAR	28703	23992
JUNAGARH	134091	131101

Food grains and funds at the school/cooking agency level/

- Foodgrains were available in all the visited schools and cooking cost was also released in all the visited schools. To ensure consistency in procurement, centralized procurement system has been adopted by the GSCSC for purchase of edible oil, pulses and other necessary ingredients.
- The food grains and other commodities are regularly tested in laboratorie by Gujarat civil Supplies Corporation,.The inspection of food grains being lifted from FCI/ millers are not inspected by MDM.at the state, district or taluka level.Procurement and supply of all commodities is based on number of beneficiaries and reconciled regularly.

1.7 Quality and Quantity of food:

In the sampled schools in the both the districts observed that quality of the meals served is good and children are satisfied with the food. Although the meals were deficient in terms of vegetables. The reason stated by cooks, teachers, and administration across board was that “children do not like vegetables”. The importance of nutrition component of the midday meal, through vegetables needs to be strengthened. The review mission team was of the view that the concept of vegetables should be developed among children. Mission observed that FAQ rice, wheat flour has been supplied for the MDMS. The quality of pulses / dals and oil made available at the school through FPS which is procured by the state government was also of fair quality.

Quantity of food being cooked everyday was on an adhoc basis. There was no standard means of measuring the quantity of grains/ pulses to be cooked every day by the cooks. The measure of quantity of food served to children was on basis of “ children are satiated” as stated by the cooks. In most cases, the quantity of the meal served was dependent on the size of the plate which varied widely from school to school(quarter plates to full plate size thalis) were being used which were available at the school. However, in the rural schools, the committee observed that the quantity of food being served was adequate.

Contents of Micronutrients in 50 gms of Wheat flour (45 days of validity of the date of packing)

1. Iron 7.5.
2. Vitamin A- 150
3. Calcium -250 micrograms
4. Thymin – 0.30
5. Niasin -3.5
6. Riboflavin .033
7. Vitamin C- 10 Mg.
8. Folic Acid – 50
- 9.

The Government is incurring a cost of 72 paise per day per child for primary school children and Rs. 1.07 per child in upper primary.

1.8 Variety of Menu

The mission has found that in majority of the schools/implementing agency weekly menu was displayed, though it was not painted on the outside wall of the school. It was also observed that the implementing agencies were serving meal according to the weekly menu.

Menu

Monday	Lapsi, Sukhadi
Tuesday	Khichadi, Vegetables
Wednesday	Dal- Dhokli
Thursday	Dal-Rice
Friday	Muthiya, Handvo
Saturday	Vegetable- Pulav

1.9 Trends in the coverage of the children under MDM scheme.

Gujarat Average for % of children availing MDM from the number of children who have attended is 82.37%, while for vi-viii classes is 77.5% as on March 31st 2010. However there is a wide variation between schools and districts. The mission found that the reasons for children not availing MDM was due to hesitation to eat MDM due to the perception that MDM was for deprived children only, seen as charity not a right of every child. In most schools the teachers were not able to link the social equity education goal of MDM with the program.

It was observed that children from the deprived sections of society were the one's who were irregular and not attending school and thus deprived by MDM. There was little coordination between SSA which is reaching out to drop out children, increase retention with the MDM program.

Difference in Enrollment attendance and actual no. of children availed MDM

District	Village	Name of School	Enrollment	Attendance	Availed	% Variation between children attending and availing	% of children enrolled and availing MDM
Porbandar	Bhod	Shri Lok Pramik Shala	290	242	113	46.80%	39.00%
Junagadh	Sukhpur	Sukhpur Primary School	95	76	43	56.57%	45.26%
Porbandar	Porbandar	Branch Primary School	555	423	270	63.60%	48.73%
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kuchedi Sim Shala 1	226	180	118	66.11%	52.32%
Junagadh	Sapor Sorath	kumar Shala	221	169	122	72.12%	55.21%
Junagadh	Sapor Sorath	Kanya Shala	203	170	124	73.21%	61.25%
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kantela	335	275	253	92%	75.76%

1.10 Satisfaction of Children/parents/teachers about the implementation and impact of the scheme

The children and teachers were satisfied with the quantity and quality of MDM served in the school. Quality of food served was satisfactory in appearance and taste wise in most of the schools. It was observed that menu is prescribed by the state, the state officials indicated that the district had the option of making local changes but few local change of menu was observed in the schools visited by the team.

There was a wide variation between population and their tastes within the district.. Cooks and teachers suggested that variation in the menu's depending on the acceptability of food should be allowed at the school level within the prescribed directives. Most children showed preference for rice and dal based items over wheat flour based items.

1.11 Role of teachers and Involvement of community

- i) In most rural schools teachers ensured that food is eaten in orderly and hygienic manner. In some schools teachers also took turns everyday to eat the food with children.
- ii) Some principals and teachers had taken initiative to discuss the issues of social equity, importance of eating together and nutrition which showed in the increased number of children availing the scheme. This variation in children availing MDM is wide inter and intra districts.
- iii) There was high involvement of the community in providing support to the school for vessels especially plates and spoon. In every school the governments initiative of encouraging community to host meals in the school during festivals/ ceremonial occasions “ tithi bhojan” was being implemented, with at least 1-2 days of tithi bhjojan every month. The practice was more common in rural schools than urban schools especially those situated in poor communities.
- iv) Involvement of the community in monitoring the scheme at the village level through regular visits during meal times was not prevalent.. The involvement of teachers and community members in ensuring that children eat together in a spirit of camaraderie and develop sensitivity to their peers with different abilities by offering them precedence and instilling values of equality and cooperation would be very valuable support to the implementation of the programme.
- v) Each centre is entrusted with one overall supervisor, "organizer/sanchalak". Each Sanchalak has a cook and helper under him/her. Cook is responsible for cooking the meal as per the prescribed menu and helper is entrusted with the task of maintain hygiene. A teacher /principal of the school is also given the responsibility to see that the cooking and serving meal is properly done.

1.12 Convergence with Department of Health for providing Iron, Folic Acid and Vitamin A and supplementation of micro nutrients and health check-ups under School Health Programme of NRHM

The Mission has observed that regular health check-ups are been carried out in most of the sampled schools. Some of the Head Masters informed that health check-ups have been carried out, and also records were maintained at the school level.

Maintenance of records at schools/cooking agency level

- i) All the records related to the implementation of MDM in schools are maintained by the organizer cum cook of the MDSM scheme. The Organizer makes the purchase of items for providing the hot cooked meals, either on a daily or weekly basis through the local vendors.

The mission has observed that schools are maintaining the following registers:

- Attendance register
- Food grain register
- Register for MDM cooking cost
- Register for Cook-cum-helpers
- Monitoring Registers.

1.13 AVAILABILITY OF INFRASTRUCTURE FACILITIES

Availability of Kitchen –cum-stores

State Government has been entrusted the task of construction of kitchen sheds to SSA from SSA the fund flows to Gram Panchayat. Majority of the schools visited were having kitchen sheds except Kharwah Prathmik shala, Subashnagar, Porbandar. Where there was a space problem.

Mode of cooking

The mission members found that all the schools were only using firewood for cooking. There was a demand for LPG cylinders by the in order to maintain cleanliness and hygiene. The state may adopt renewable energy sources such as biogas fired chullahs and solar cookers.

Availability of infrastructural facilities

District	Village	Name of School	Kitchen Shed	Store	Cooking in School or at the cooks home	Cooking Fuel
Junagadh	Sukhpur	Sukhpur Pramik Shala	Under Construction	Classroom	Home	Firewood
Junagadh	Junagadh	Gram Udyog mandir	Constructed	In Shed	School	Firewood
Junagadh	Shapur Sorath	kumar Shala	Constructed	In Shed	School	Firewood
Junagadh	Shapur Sorath	Kanya Shala	Constructed	In Shed	School	Firewood
Junagadh	Ward No. 1- Daulatpura	Daulatpura Prathmik Shala	Constructed	In Shed	School	Firewood
Porbandar	Porbandar	Renawada	Constructed	In Shed	School	Firewood
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kuchedi Sim Shala 2	Constructed	In Shed	School	Firewood
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kuchedi Sim Shala 1	To be Constructed	Classroom	School	Firewood
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kantela Primary School	Constructed	In Shed	School	Firewood
Porbandar	Bhod	Shri Lok Pramik Shala	To be Constructed	Classroom	School	Firewood
Porbandar	Subhashnagar	Subhashnagar Primary School	To be Constructed	Home	Home	Firewood
Porbandar	Porbandar	Branch Primary School,	Constructed	In Shed	School	Firewood

Drinking Water Facility and Toilets

Almost all the schools visited had water facilities for drinking and other purposes. All the schools visited were having toilet facility. As per GOI guidelines, drinking water should be provided in all the schools serving MDM especially in kitchens through convergence with Departments of Drinking Water. The Mission members found drinking water facilities in 40% of schools visited in Porbandar had no current provision of drinking water. In two schools, the facility was defunct and as soon as attention was drawn to this fact, in one schools the teachers took the responsibility of ensuring that taps would be installed

immediately in the tanks so that children have access to clean drinking water. In the Kuchedi Sim Shala 1, the teachers expressed their inability to solve the problem as the water had to be drawn from nearby source. The Sarpanch of Kuchedi showed us the lines that were already underway and the last leg was to be completed. He assured us that the water would be made available within a weeks' period. In the third site at Subhashnagar where over 600 children were enrolled, the Collector personally took up on himself to ensure that clean drinking water was made available in the school. The problem is larger at the level of maintenance of drinking water assets than coverage,

Kitchen Devices:

All the schools visited were having kitchen devices. Maximum schools stated donors and local people have provided the plates for the children. Further majority of the schools have received the kitchen devices money less than Rs. 5000. There is a need for storage bins and serving utensils in all the visited schools.

Amount received by the institutions for the procurement of Kitchen devices

Block	Village	Name of School	Amount received
Vanthali	Sapor Sorath	kumar Shala	3500
Vanthali	Sapor Sorath	Kanya Shala	3500
Junagadh	Ward No. 1- Daulatpura	Daulatpura	-
Porbandar	Porbandar	Renawada	3500
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kuchedi Sim Shala 2	-
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kuchedi Sim Shala 1	Not received
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kantela	3800
Ranavav	Bhod	Shri Lok Pramik Shala	6000
Porbandar	Subhashnagar	Subhashnagar Primary School	5000
Porbandar	Porbandar	Branch Primary School	5000

1.14 Vigilance and monitoring:

District	Village	Name of School	Monitoring Visits	Last date in visit book
Junagadh	Sukhpur	Sukhpur Primary School	Nil	
Junagadh	Junagadh	Gram Udyog mandir	1	Sep-08
Junagadh	Shapur Sorath	kumar Shala	Nil	
Junagadh	Shapur Sorath	Kanya Shala	Nil	

Junagadh	Ward No. 1- Daulatpura	Daulatpura	2	Aug-10
Porbandar	Porbandar	Renawada	Nil	
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kuchedi Sim Shala 2	1	Sep-08
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kuchedi Sim Shala 1	Nil	
Porbandar	Porbandar	Kantela		
Porbandar	Bhod	Shri Lok Pramik Shala	2	Sep-06
Porbandar	Subhashnagar	Subhashnagar Primary School	1	28-Jul-09
Porbandar	Porbandar	Branch Primary School	Nil	

VEC meeting: 17 June 2010

There were no community members save a shopkeeper representative who was member and participated in the meeting

“MDM was discussed in the meeting. The organizer was asked to maintain cleanliness in the kitchen and add vegetables to the menu. ...”

Observation of the District Planning Officer, Subhashnagar primary school on 28 July 2009.

“The principal is absent for the last two days. Met the organizer today. The cook runs the kitchen from home, which is very serious. He must get permission from the Sanchalak.”

There was lack of regular monitoring at the school level as observed by the review mission. In 50% of the schools no monitoring visits were noted in the records while no follow up action was taken on the observations made during monitoring.

However, in order to ensure that there is no major gap in meals for children at school, the state govt has adopted an innovative approach of releasing cooking costs in advance on a quarterly basis district level and on a monthly basis at the school level.

State Level Steering Committee has been notified on 11 March 2008 under the chairmanship of Chief Secretary, Govt of Gujarat. So far no meeting has taken place.

1.15 Availability of Cook cum Helper for the implementation of Scheme at State, District and School level

District	Village	Total	ST	SC	OBC	Others	Male	Female
----------	---------	-------	----	----	-----	--------	------	--------

		Cooks					cook cum organiser	cook cum organizer
Junagadh	Sukhpur	3	0	0	3	1	1	2
Junagadh	Junagadh	3	0	0	2	1	0	3
Junagadh	Shapur Sorath	3	0	0	3	0	0	3
Junagadh	Shapur Sorath	3	0	0	3	0	1	2
Junagadh	Ward No. 1- Daulatpura	3	0	0	3	0	0	3
Porbandar	Porbandar	3	0	0	2	0	1	2
Porbandar	Porbandar	3	0	0	3	0	0	3
Porbandar	Porbandar	3	0	0	3	0	0	3
Porbandar	Porbandar	4	0	0	2	2	0	4
Porbandar	Bhod	3	0	0	3	0	1	2
Porbandar	Subhashnagar	4	0	0	4	0	1	3
Porbandar	Porbandar	3	0	0	3	0	1	2
		38	0	0	34	4	6	32
			0.0%	0.0%	89.5%	10.5%	15.8%	84.2%

As per the instructions issued by the Government of India 2009 ,

1. Number of cooks-cum-helpers to be engaged in a school will depend on the strength of the students in the school. One cook-cum-helper may be engaged in a school having upto 25 students, two cooks-cum-helpers for schools having 26-100 students and one additional cook-cum-helpers for schools having 26-100 students and one additional cooks-cum –helpers for every addition of upto 100 students. The norms are given for guidance only; the State/UTs have flexibility in determining actual number of cook-cum-helpers need based on the enrolment/no. of children opted MDM in the schools.
2. Cook-cum-helper appointed in the schools is expected to perform all activities relating to cooking, serving and washing the utensils. The person who is involved in these activities will be entitled for the honorarium of Rs.1000/ month for their part time service rendered in the schools for period of 10 months. In the drought affected areas, where MDM is served during the summer vacations, cooks-cum-helpers are entitled for honorarium for that said period.

3. The expenditure towards the honorarium of cooks-cum-helpers are now shared between the central govt. and the NER States on 90:10 basis and with other States/UTs on 75:25 basis.
4. In urban areas, where a centralized kitchen is given the responsibility for cooking/supplying of MDM, the norms for appointment of cooks-cum-helpers are same as cook-cum-helpers appointed in an individual schools. However, in schools where the meal is prepared at centralized kitchen, the States/UTs have the flexibility for appointing helpers at school level for distribution and serving meal by another agency/school.
5. In case of centralized kitchen, if the meal is not served in the schools by cooks-cum-helpers appointed by them, then the honorarium can be apportioned between the centralized kitchen and agency/individual serving meal in the school.
6. The principle and procedure for apportionment of honorarium between centralized kitchen and school/individual providing the services can be laid down by the State/UT as appropriate.

Norms of GOI and Norms followed by the Government of Gujarat

Strength of Institutions	GOI	Govt of Gujarat	No of Schools (2009-2010)
Upto 25 children	1 cook cum helper@ Rs. 1000 Per month	1 cook cum organiser@ Rs. 1000/- p.m 1 Cook@ 400/-p.m 1 helper@200/p.m	1668
From 25 to 100 Children	2 cook cum helpers@Rs 1000/- per month	1 cook cum organiser@ Rs. 1000/- p.m 1 Cook- cum-helper@ 1000/-p.m 1 helper@400/p.m	13007
For 100 to 200 children	1 additional cook cum helper for	1 cook cum organiser@ Rs. 1000/- p.m	9343

	every addition of upto 100 students	2 Cook- cum-helper@ 1000/-p.m	
For more than 200 and additionally every 100 students	For every addition of 100, one extra cook	Rs. 1000/- per month for every additional cook cum helper	3359

The norms laid down by Govt of Gujarat are more liberal than Govt of India. The extra payment for positions/ entitlements not covered by Govt of India should be borne by Govt of Gujarat. There is no concept of organizer in Government of India. However, the mission observed that the organizer apart from cooking, handled procurement and also maintained records. This is beneficial for the scheme as the teachers do not have to take additional burden of maintaining daily records of scheme which affects teaching activity.

There were no significant tribal populations in these districts, however there were no dalit cooks employed in any of villages.

Sanctioned Strength of MDM Establishment at State and District level:

	Sanctioned	Positions Filled	Vacant
State Commission rate	43	28	15
District Level	294	184	110
Taluka/ Block Level	942	505	437
Municipal Corporation	48	24	24
Total	1327	741(55%)	586 (45%)

The lack of personnel affects the implementation of the scheme and effective monitoring of the scheme at all levels. The team was amazed to find the shortage of manpower to implement the scheme at state, district and taluka levels. This results in delays in release and lifting of food grains, payment to FCI, release of cooking costs. considerably delays in reporting from the taluka to district and state level and from state to centre. This delayed reporting affects the implementation of the scheme at the central level also, since unless the details of unspent balances are received at the end of financial year, allocation of food grains and cooking costs cannot be released in time.

The inspection and audit is inadequate of the scheme at the taluka and district level is due to the shortage of staff. There is also no regulatory inspection from the department on the

quantity and quality of grain for the grain from FCI or the miller supplying Atta to the schools for the MDM program.

Management Information System

Office up to taluka level has been covered under LAN/GS-WAN by State Govt. All offices from taluka level, district level to commissionerate have to be fully computerized and a software to be prepared to get on line information of statistical data, operational data from MDM centre to State level.

Involvement of NGO/Civic Body

The Government of Gujarat and The Akshaya Patra Foundation & Stri Shakti had signed a MoU to feed children in the Ahmedabad East, West, Gandhinagar City and Gandhinagar Rural & Baroda Corporation. The number of students taking M.D.M. in these schools is 2.38 lakh.

Stri shakti NGO

Stri shakti is feeding to 441 schools and 80 thousand children per day. The Review Mission members found that there are 100 cooks cum Helpers out of 100, 60 are females. Green leafy Vegetables are absent from the menu, only potato and bottle gourd are being served with Bengal gram pulse. There are 33 vehicles, carry the meal up to the school level. There are 441 schools run in two shifts and food is also prepared and delivered at school level in two shifts. The food is prepared for 80 thousand children on an average basis. The Stri shakti is being paid Rs. 2.00 per day/child. The Manager stri shakti informed that the Rs. 2.00 per day per child is much less and the reason of non inclusion of vegetables is because of the price and also children in Ahemdabad does not have the liking for vegetables. The quantity of food per child observed by the mission was not adequate as per the norms.

Recommendations:

1. Coverage of children:

There is a requirement to narrow the gap between the children attending school and actual number of children availing MDM.

2. Shortage of Staff

There is acute shortage of staff in the State to implement the scheme .Proper implementation of the scheme requires regular administrative and financial inspections of the MDM scheme at all levels to ensure that the resources are fully utilized for the goals of the program This deficiency needs to be rectified at the earliest by filling up of vacant post in 6 months time. The work of implementation of MDM at District level and down below may be entrusted to Deptt. Of primary Education and not revenue department.

3. Better Convergence

It has been observed that there is a good convergence between the various programmes of Govt. of India and which are being implemented by Gujarat Govt. However, better convergence is required between the other programmes of SSA Sajaladhara and other programmes implemented by the Panchayats. The Cluster Resource Centres maybe a good point for sub taluka level monitoring and awareness of the goals of the scheme.

4. Transportation cost up to school Level

The food grains (rice) are not being delivered at school level, therefore the school authority are bound to lift the same from the PDS shops for which transportation charges are not being provided..

5. Creation of separate MDM cell for Monitoring and Supervision of MDMS.

A post of Commissioner MDM should be created for proper supervision and to check effective implementation of the scheme.

A separate MDM cell at different levels namely State, district and Taluka level under Education Department should be established and consultants, coordinators, research assistants, support staff and messengers may be engaged for these cells

for proper implementation of the MDM scheme. MIS should be developed to ensure proper monitoring of the scheme

6. Problems of Centralized kitchens

The Mission visited a centralized kitchen run by an NGO called Stri shakti. It was observed that they are being paid Rs. 2.00/per day/child which is much below the unit cost. They are not able to add vegetable in the meal as result of the same. Further, the NGO is also not being paid the honorarium of cook cum helper and transportation charges. They may be paid full unit cost to avoid poor implementation of the scheme.

7. Monitoring of the Scheme

As per the para 6.2 of MDM Guidelines 2006, State Government should to fix monthly targets for inspection of mid-day meal served in Schools/EGS-AIE Centres . On an average 25% of the Primary Schools and EGS/AIE Centres should be visited in every quarter, and all Primary Schools and EGS/AIE Centres should be visited at least once every year. States may evolve suitable formats for Questionnaire for capturing the data.

8. Involvement of community

Community participation should be encouraged. Mothers of the children should be asked to visit the school by rotation to ensure that food in proper quality and quantity is served. They can also ensure that hygiene is maintained in cooking, serving and eating of Mid day Meal. There is also a need to improve the participation of community members especially of the poorer sections of society due to their family responsibility and enlist the support of higher caste for the purpose..

9. Serving Vegetables as per norms

Vegetables in prescribed quantity should be included in the menu every day. Regular availability of vegetables and cost of vegetables throughout the year was stated as a problem by cooks. Hence, government may consider replacing the whole pulses such as Moong, Chana , Masoor in place of Dals for distribution for their nutritional value and to make up for unavailability of green vegetables during certain seasons.

10. Social Equity

The variation in the children availing meals varied from school to school within the district. MDM is also means for promoting Social equity hence the need for all children to eat together should be taken up in a campaign mode.

11. Health and Hygiene

Hygiene, nutrition education and social equity are key goals for the program which require strengthening at school level and community level.

12. Kitchen Devices

The funds released by Govt of india for purchase of Kitchen devices should be utilized within six months. Transfer of funds at school level should be promoted to ensure full utilization of funds .

13. Utilization of MME Funds.

As per the latest instructions issued by the ministry 50% of the MME fund should be allocated to the schools ,which can be utilized by them for meeting local needs like soaps, plates, glasses, mats, storage bins, replacement and repair of cooking devices hiring charges of manpower, transport and publicity.

14. Grievance Redressal

A grievance redressal cell at State level may be set up as per the GOI guidelines. It will communicate complaints to the concerned authority without delay.

ANNEXURE 1

Officials Met during the period of Review Mission

SN.	Name	Designation	Organisation
1.	Shri R.P.Gupta	Secretary Primary Education	Education Department, GoG
2.	Shri C.V. Som	Commissioner MDM and schools	Education Department,
3.	Shri A.M. Parmar	Collector , Junagadh	GoG
4	Shri Girish Shah	Collector , Porbandar	GoG
5.	Shri.Bancha Nigi Pani	DDO, Junagadh	
6	Shri. D. B. Mehta	Joint Commissioner	Education Department, GoG
7	Shri Ramesh Chandra Patel	Dy. Secretary	Education Department, GoG
8	S.D. Choudhry	Asst. Commissioner, MDM	Education Department, GoG
9	Shri Rao	Manager Civil supply, Corporation	Civil Supply Department, GoG
10	Shri. S.N. Kalyani	Dy. Collector, MDM Junagadh	GoG
11	Dr. V.D.Varu	Dy. District Primary Education Officer	Education Dept , GoG
12	Shri .Bharat Singh Parmar	Representation of SSA	Education Dept , GoG
13	Shri . Rajput	Mamladar, Junagarh	Revenue Dept. GoG
14	Shri Sutreja	Manager Civil supply Corporation Junagadh	Civil Supply Department, GoG
15	Shri M. R. Pagarka	District Primary Education Officer, Junagadh	Education Dept , GoG
16	Shri . Tanna	Sub Divisional Magistrate, Porbandar	GoG
17	Shri Bhatt	Dy. Collector MDM Porbandar	GoG
18	Shri. Shah	District Supply Officer, Porbandar	GoG
19	Shri. Kayada	Mamladar, Porbandar	GoG
20	Shri Hariyani	District Primary Education Officer Porbandar	GoG
21	Mr. Kamlesh Parmar	Project Manager, SSA, Porbandar	GoG
22	Shri Ashok Lakhani	Chief Medical Officer, Porbandar	GoG
23	Dr. Yogesh Dave	Pediatric Doctor, Porbandar	GoG
24	Shri. M. B. Nayak	Mamladar, Porbandar	GoG
25	Sarpanch	Gram Sarpanch Kantela	Porbandar
26	Sarpanch Rinawadda	Gram Panchayat Rinawadda	Porbandar
27	Shri Joshi	Talati, Kuchdri	Porbandar
28	Shri. Bhavesh Patel	Dy. Mamledar, MDM	Porbandar
29	Mr. Dulera	Research Officer, commissionerate, MDM	GoG

ANNEXURE 2

List of Schools Visited

S N.	District	Taluka	Village	Name of the School
1	Junagadh	Vanthali	Sapor Sorath	kumar Shala
2	Junagadh	Vanthali	Sapor Sorath	Kanya Shala
3	Junagadh	Junagadh	Ward No. 1- Daulatpura	Daulatpura
4	Porbandar	Porbandar	Porbandar	Renawada
5	Porbandar	Porbandar	Porbandar	Kuchedi Sim Shala 2
6	Porbandar	Porbandar	Porbandar	Kuchedi Sim Shala 1
7	Porbandar	Porbandar	Porbandar	Kantela
8	Porbandar	Ranavav	Bhod	Shri Lok Pramik Shala
9	Porbandar	Porbandar	Subhashnagar	Subhashnagar Primary School 131, Kharvawad
10	Porbandar	Porbandar	Porbandar	Branch Primary School
11.	Porbandar	Porbandar	Rinawadda	Primary school Rinawadda